

**PLANO INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT  
DISTRICT RECONSIDERATION OF LIBRARY MATERIALS COMMITTEE REPORT**

*This report corresponds with the **Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials** designed for challenges to works made available for voluntary reading and inquiry in school libraries as described in **Board Policy EFB Local**. Challenges related to the instructional use of a work are addressed in **Board Policy EFA Local**. All reconsideration committee members must read, watch, or listen to (according to the item type) the challenged material in its entirety in order to participate.*

**Date of Committee Meeting:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Title of Material:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Author/Producer:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECTION I: Harmful & Obscene Content**

1. Does the work include descriptions or representations of any of the content listed below?

- sexual intercourse, including oral sex
- sodomy (anal)
- sexual bestiality
- masturbation
- excretory functions (sexual)
- sadism
- masochism
- lewd exhibition of genitals
- genitals in a state of sexual stimulation or arousal
- covered male genitals in a discernibly turgid state
- a device designed and marketed as useful primarily for stimulation of the human genital organs

- ☐ **No** - Stop. Continue to section II.
- ☐ **Yes** - Continue filling out this section.

2. On a scale of 1-5, with 1 being not explicit and 5 being very explicit, how explicit or graphic is the description or depiction of sexual conduct contained in the material?

|       |
|-------|
| _____ |
|-------|

3. On a scale of 1-5, with 1 being a single or nominal depiction of sexual or excretory organs/activities and 5 being a predominance of sexual or excretory organs/activities depicted throughout the work, how prominent is the sexual conduct?

|       |
|-------|
| _____ |
|-------|

4. On a scale of 1-5, with 1 being "does not" and 5 being "very intentional", to what extent would a reasonable person find that the material intentionally panders to, titillates, or shocks the reader?

|       |
|-------|
| _____ |
|-------|

5. Does the dominant theme of the work, when taken as a whole, appeal to the prurient interest of a minor, in sex, nudity, or excretion? (*Prurient definitions: Marked by or arousing an immoderate or unwholesome interest or desire. Having or showing too much interest in sex. Causing lasciviousness or lust.*)

- ☐ **No**
- ☐ **Yes**

6. Considering the dominant theme of the work as a whole, is the work LACKING serious literary, artistic, political, and scientific value?

- ☐ **No**
- ☐ **Yes**

7. Considering the dominant theme of the work as a whole, is the work utterly WITHOUT redeeming social value for minors?

- ☐ No  
☐ Yes

#### SECTION I SUMMARY:

Do ALL 3 of these apply?

- The committee answered YES to question 5.
- The committee answered YES to either question 6 or 7 (or both).
- The TOTAL value from questions 2, 3, & 4 above equals 10-15.

- ☐ **Yes** - The book is considered harmful and/or obscene. Continue to section III.
- ☐ **No** - Continue to section II. *In your final deliberations consider the content of section I and the degree to which the average adult in the Plano ISD community would be comfortable with a student (of the youngest age to which this book is available) reading the content.*

#### SECTION II: Review of Selection Criteria

##### Rating Scale

(put NA if not applicable)

| 1   | 2  | 3  | 4  | 5  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| Title <b>does not satisfy</b> the criteria for the age range to which the title is currently available. | Title has <b>a few attributes</b> that satisfy the criteria for the age range to which the title is currently available. | Title as a whole is <b>sufficient</b> to satisfy the criteria for the age range to which the title is currently available. | Title as a whole is <b>more than sufficient</b> to satisfy the criteria for the age range to which the title is currently available. | Title as a whole <b>excels</b> at satisfying the criteria for the age range to which the title is currently available. |

##### Board Policy EFB (Local) Criteria

|   |  |       |
|---|--|-------|
| 1 | To what degree does the work enrich and support the curriculum, by stimulating growth in factual knowledge, enjoyment of reading, literary appreciation, and aesthetic values.                   | _____ |
| 2 | To what degree does the work take into consideration students' varied interests, abilities, learning styles, and maturity levels.  | _____ |
| 3 | To what degree does the work support a balanced library collection presenting multiple viewpoints related to controversial issues to foster critical thinking skills based on rational analysis. | _____ |
| 4 | To what degree does the work represent ethnic, religious, and cultural groups and their contributions to the national heritage and world community.  | _____ |
| 5 | To what degree does the work provide a wide range of background information that will enable students to think critically and make informed decisions.   | _____ |

|  |   |       |
|--|---|-------|
| 6  | To what degree does the work demonstrate literary merit, quality, value, and significance.  | _____ |
| 7  | To what degree has the work received favorable professional library reviews from state and nationally recognized review publications or a local review. | _____ |
| 8  | To what degree does the work provide topics, authors, series, or genres that fill gaps in the school library collection.                                | _____ |
| 9  | To what degree does the work include accurate and authentic factual content from authoritative sources.   | _____ |
| 10   | To what degree does the work have a high degree of potential user appeal and interest.  | _____ |
| 11   | Represent diverse viewpoints and cultures in campus collections to reflect the unique background of its student population.                             | _____ |
| T  | Total of Lines 1-11   | _____ |
| <b>SECTION 2 SUMMARY:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Title does not meet criteria (1-24)</li> <li>• Title meets some criteria (25-44)</li> <li>• Title meetings most/all criteria (45-60)</li> </ul> |   |       |

## SECTION III: Final Decision

☐ Remove from all campus libraries

- ☐ Title is considered harmful &/or obscene per section I.  
☐ Title does not meet criteria  
☐ Title meets some, most, or all criteria. Provide description of rationale below:

---

---

---

Material remains in circulation at the following campus level(s):

- ☐ Early Childhood  
☐ Elementary Schools  
☐ Middle Schools  
☐ High Schools  
☐ Senior High Schools

AND

☐ Remove material from libraries at the following level(s):

- ☐ Title meets some, most, or all criteria (25-60) but is only age appropriate for certain campus levels. Provide description of rationale below.

---

---

---

---

---

☐ Continue use of material at current campus level(s)

Title meets some, most, or all criteria (25-60). Provide description of rationale below.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

\_\_\_\_\_  
Committee Facilitator Name\* (printed)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Committee Facilitator Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

*\*The Committee Facilitator guides the committee through the reconsideration process, providing policy information and answering procedural questions. The Facilitator does not vote on the material in question.*

Signatures of Reconsideration Committee Members:

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_